

**A REMARK ON “COUNTING PRIMITIVE ELEMENTS
IN FREE GROUPS” (BY J. BURILLO AND
E. VENTURA)**

IGOR RIVIN

In the paper [BV02] the authors give estimates on the growth rate of the number of *primitive* elements in free groups, as a function of word length (a primitive element in the free group of rank p is an element which is a member of a generating set containing exactly p elements). They produce estimates on the *exponential growth rate* of the number of such primitive elements (recall that the exponential growth rate of a set S in F_p is defined in [BV02] to be

$$d_X(S) = \limsup_{N \rightarrow \infty} \left[\frac{\text{no. of elements of } S \text{ of wordlength at most } N}{\text{no. of elements in } F_p \text{ of wordlength at most } N} \right]^{\frac{1}{N}}.$$

The authors produce upper and lower bounds on the exponential growth rate of the number of primitive elements, but they omit the following observation:

Theorem 0.1. *In F_2 the exponential growth rate of the number of primitive elements equals $1/\sqrt{3}$.*

This observation is significant, since F_2 is the only (nonabelian) free group where the exact value of the exponential growth rate can be computed.

Proof of Theorem 0.1. The result will follow immediately from [BV02, Proposition 4.1] and Theorem 0.2 below. $\square$

Theorem 0.2. *The exponential growth rate of the number of cyclically reduced primitive elements in F_2 equals $1/3$.*

Proof. It is sufficient to show that the number of cyclically reduced primitive elements in F_2 grows subexponentially. To show this, note that each such elements (up to rotation) corresponds to a *simple geodesic* on the hyperbolic punctured torus (this is classical, going back

Date: today.

1991 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary 20E05.

Key words and phrases. primitive elements, free groups, punctured tori.

The author was supported by a grant from the National Science Foundation.

to at least Fenchel, but the first reference known to me is [OZ81]). Furthermore, the number of simple geodesics of (hyperbolic) length bounded above by L on the punctured torus grows quadratically in L (see [MR95b] for precise results), and for each hyperbolic structure on the punctured torus there is a constant $C > 0$, such that the ratio of the hyperbolic length to the word length is at least $1/C$ and at most C . This is shown in [MR95a]. The result follows immediately. $\square$

REFERENCES

- BV02. J. Burillo and E. Ventura. *Counting primitive elements in free groups*, Geom. Dedicata **93**(2002), pp. 143-162.
- MR95a. G. McShane and I. Rivin. *A norm on homology of surfaces and counting simple geodesics*, IMRN, 1995, no. 2, pp. 61-69.
- MR95b. G. McShane and I. Rivin. *Simple curves on hyperbolic tori*, C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris, Ser. 1, Math. **320**(1995), no. 12, 1523-1528.
- OZ81. R. Osborne and H. Zieschang. *Primitives in free group on two generators*, Invent. Math. **63**(1981), no. 1, pp. 17-24

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, TEMPLE UNIVERSITY, PHILADELPHIA
Current address: Mathematics Department, Princeton University
E-mail address: rivin@math.temple.edu